

Reprints from the

International Trumpet Guild® Journal

to promote communications among trumpet players around the world and to improve the artistic level of performance, teaching, and literature associated with the trumpet

HAYDN'S *TRUMPET CONCERTO*: THE TEMPO AND ARTICULATION OF THE *ANDANTE* MOVEMENT

BY BRIAN MOORE

JANUARY 2007 • PAGE 40

The International Trumpet Guild' (ITG) is the copyright owner of all data contained in this file. ITG gives the individual end-user the right to:

- Download and retain an electronic copy of this file on a single workstation that you own
- Transmit an unaltered copy of this file to any single individual end-user, so long as no fee, whether direct or indirect is charged
- Print a single copy of pages of this file
- Quote fair use passages of this file in not-for-profit research papers as long as the ITGJ, date, and page number are cited as the source.

The International Trumpet Guild' prohibits the following without prior written permission:

- Duplication or distribution of this file, the data contained herein, or printed copies made from this file for profit or for a charge, whether direct or indirect
- Transmission of this file or the data contained herein to more than one individual end-user
- Distribution of this file or the data contained herein in any form to more than one end user (as in the form of a chain letter)
- Printing or distribution of more than a single copy of the pages of this file
- Alteration of this file or the data contained herein
- Placement of this file on any web site, server, or any other database or device that allows for the accessing or copying of this file or the data contained herein by any third party, including such a device intended to be used wholly within an institution.

<http://www.trumpetguild.org>

Please retain this cover sheet with printed document.

HAYDN'S *TRUMPET CONCERTO*: THE TEMPO AND ARTICULATION OF THE *ANDANTE* MOVEMENT

BY BRIAN MOORE

This article was reviewed and approved for publication by the ITG Editorial Committee.

This article is intended to provoke. I shall start with a bald statement: I think the majority of modern performances take the *Andante* in Haydn's *Trumpet Concerto* too slowly. Below, I shall set out my reasons for thinking this, and the implications for our understanding of the movement. This article is a mixture of academic and personal observations. As a trumpeter, I hope to be able to produce a personal interpretation, but one that is also true to the intentions of the composer. So the academic in me asks the question: what were Haydn's intentions, and how can we know them?

But first, a quotation:

The habit of playing records has its dangers. In turning on Columbia DX 933 I found myself listening to a fragrant six-eight orchestral melody that might have been left out of Haydn's *The Seasons* by mistake. After eight bars and a tonic close the moment seemed to have come for the soprano to enter with a song about fields and flowers. Instead of which I was suddenly hit in the ear by a trumpet, and the shock was bad for my nerves. Apart from the blare, and the palpable misfit, the tone and the tune brought an unmistakable echo of that languishing and undignified tearfulness so often wafted to our senses by "songs of Araby" at a street corner. All of which is extremely unfair to that admirable trumpeter George Eskdale, who does an artist's job with fidelity and skill. On looking up Haydn's works I find no mention of a concerto for trumpet; but the list mentions a concerto for clarino, and if this is the one played by Mr. Eskdale, all may yet be explained. No doubt the clarino, now a dictionary instrument, had an aptitude for soothing song that the trumpet lacks. (McNaught 1939, 749).

This priceless quote from a 1939 review of Eskdale's famous recording of Haydn's concerto is revealing for a number of reasons. Not least is it fascinating for the naivety of the writer: it is difficult to imagine a time when Haydn's greatest concerto was unknown, even to the critics. It is also interesting to ask whether McNaught's "innocent ear" was yearning for the sound of the keyed trumpet—something that modern listeners are fortunate enough to be able to experience. I shall return to this quote later... but first, some personal observations.

I started to learn Haydn's *Trumpet Concerto* about 28 years ago, and, in turn, have been helping my students learn this masterpiece. It is a piece of music, which, no matter how many times I play it or teach it, never loses its freshness for me. As a teacher, I am fairly tolerant of different interpretations; I rarely say, "I think that's wrong." However, it has long been my intuition that most performances of the *Andante* from Haydn's *Concerto* simply sound too slow: they sound *wrong*.

For an academic, however, intuition is not enough. As part

of my study into Haydn's *Concerto*, I decided to look at the tempi of various recordings, and how they might relate to Haydn's intentions. First, here is the evidence from recordings:

Tempo measurements from recordings

Performer	See	Date	Andante 8th-note =
	Below		
André	w	1963	78
André	w	1974	69
Berinbaum	w	1971	72
Calvayrac	w		78
De Ley	w		78
Delmotte	w		93
Dokshizer	w	1979	72
Eklund	a	2005	92
Eskdale	a	1939	92
Eskdale	t	1945	106
Eskdale	a	1954	104
Friedrich	a	1995	96
Geisle	w	1959	72
Hardenberger	a	1986	80
Hovaldt	w		78
Immer	a	1987	88
Jeannoutout	w	1963	78
Kejmar	a	1992	84
Krug	w	1970	90
Longinotti	w	1958	78
Marsalis	a	1982	92
Marsalis	a	1994	96
Mertens	w	1965	87
Mortimer	a	1946	92
Nakariakov	a	1993	80
Preis	w	1968	99
Scherbaum	w	1960	75
Schetsche	w	1970	78
Schneidewind	w	1964	72
Schwarz	a	2005	80
Smedvig	a	1990	80
Steele-Perkins	a	1986	76
Steele-Perkins	a	2001	94
Stevens	w	1974	81
Stringer	a	1967	104
Wallace	a	1995	72
Wobisch	a	1951	82
Average			84.1

(Sources of measurements: a: author; t: Trevena 1945; w: Willener 1981b)

To return to McNaught's quote from the beginning of this article, his reference to an imaginary 6/8 song from *The Seasons* is highly apposite. For whilst this song does not exist, there are 6/8 songs in *The Creation* that bear strong resemblances to the *Andante* of the *Trumpet Concerto*, and for these songs, we do have some strong evidence of Haydn's intentions.

Historic metronome marks are not without controversy, but there are strong arguments not to dismiss them entirely:

Much of the history of music consists of hotly argued opinions about what music actually consists of, arguments sometimes never to be resolved. Surely in this sense, though, as long as everybody is guessing, guesses closer to the time of a music's currency are at least as valid as those of any late 20th-century musicologist. It must be emphasized that, like them or not, metronome marks and associated forms of measurement [...] are all the hard evidence we have about tempos of the past. (Malloch 1993, 438)

Included in Malloch's tables of metronome observations of Czerny and Hummel are a few 6/8 *Andantes* from the late symphonies of Haydn and Mozart. These measurements show a narrow range of tempos, from ♩ = 104 to 126. Two further markings by Neukomm are apposite. Neukomm was a pupil of Haydn, and added metronome markings to his piano reduction edition (1832) of Haydn's *The Creation*, in which he stated his pedigree and that of his metronome markings:

Having so often heard this work [*The Creation*] performed under the direction of its author, and having also, on many occasions, conducted it myself in his presence, I am enabled, I hope, to render a real service to the musical world by fixing (by the metronome) the movement of all the pieces; several of which have hitherto been frequently performed in a time never intended by the composer. (Sigismund Neukomm, quoted in Temperley 1991, 237)

Here are the relevant metronome speeds cited by Malloch and Temperley:

Metronome speeds for 6/8 *Andantes*

Composer	Work	e	Source
Haydn	Symphony no. 95	104	Czerny
Haydn	Symphony no. 96	116	Czerny
Mozart	Symphony no. 38	126	Czerny/Hummel
Mozart	Symphony no. 40	116	Czerny/Hummel
Haydn	The Creation, no. 8	120	Neukomm
Haydn	The Creation, no. 21	132	Neukomm

Robbins Landon (1977, 234) notes the relation between the concerto's *Andante* and No.8 of *The Creation*—Neukomm gives the metronome marking of the latter as ♩ = 120 (Temperley 1991, 238). Whilst great caution should be exercised in using such data (especially given the small sample of relevant metronome markings given by Malloch and Temperley), it is significant that the average tempo of the recordings is twenty percent slower than the *slowest* of the markings cited by Malloch. Indeed, the slowest tempo in the recorded examples (André in 1974) is less than 60% of the average tempo cited by Malloch and Temperley; and even the *average* tempo of the recorded examples is only 71% of the *average* 6/8 *Andante*

tempo cited by Malloch and Temperley.

A perspective on this can be gained by considering Steele-Perkins's (2005) comments on his 1986 recording, which has one of the slower *Andantes* of the sample:

I think the problem was that, due to the choice of repertoire [for the disc], Tony [Halstead, the conductor] felt, and I went along with it, that there was no really slow movement in the whole album, and that's where it should be. (Steele-Perkins 2005)

This is revealing, as it exposes the tendency to think of the middle movement of the concerto as a "slow" movement, whereas the evidence provided by metronome observations suggest this approach might be mistaken. Interestingly, two timings indicated in BBC materials cited in my June 2006 *ITG Journal* article (Moore 2006) suggest that the tendency to take the *Andante* slowly might have developed since the early performances of the *Concerto* in England in the 20th Century. Eskdale's performance of 1945 took 2'50", which implies a tempo of ♩ = 106, whilst the anonymous "2½" marked in Hamilton's 1932 score implies a tempo of ♩ = 120. These are in line with the metronome speeds quoted by Malloch and Temperley.

Related to the question of tempo is that of articulation. The famous edition by Ernest Hall (see my *ITG* article from June 2006) consistently adds slurs to the thirty-second notes of the *Andante*. Many editions have followed this practice. However, there is no indication that Haydn intended these passages to be slurred; although Haydn does indicate some slurs in the solo part in the *Andante*, not once does he mark a slur over the thirty-second notes. Ed Tarr and H. C. Robbins Landon, in their 1982 edition, argue persuasively that, as with most of the sixteenth notes of the outer movements, and in common with trumpet performance practice of the time (see, for instance, Altenburg 1974, p.91), Haydn would have expected these passages to have been lightly tongued, with some kind of double or doodle tonguing. If we combine the information on tempo and articulation for the *Andante*, this movement becomes much more technically challenging—perhaps even more so than the first and third movements. Again, interestingly, Eskdale, in all his recordings, does tongue the thirty-second notes, despite his tempi being among the fastest in the recorded examples.

It would be hard to argue against the Malloch's rationale for consideration to be given to historic metronome markings:

Overall, my object is not to build a system fully linking tempos and tempo words. I simply wish to testify for the legitimacy of the kind of hard tempo evidence I have brought forward and to put it into practice, so that we can begin to renew a sensitivity to areas of stylised feeling from the past which have dropped from view. [...] We should put these [tempo] marks to use, at least experimentally, as keys to a composer's, and a time's, expressive intentions. (Malloch 1993, 443)

It is my contention that, in performing the *Andante* too slowly, most modern performers distort its nature. Reviewing Steele-Perkins's 2001 recording, Jonathan Freeman Attwood (2002) talks of the effect of hearing "music we thought we knew." Indeed, the performer who does challenge an accepted consensus takes a risk. Malloch's rationale suggests that it is a worthwhile risk.

So where does that leave us? I shall end this article with a challenge: set your metronome to ♩ = 120 and learn to play the notes at this tempo, articulating the thirty-second notes gently but clearly. Then discover how to make it musical. I suggest that the aim here is to make the thirty-second notes sound unrushed. If you succeed in this challenge, I believe you will understand Haydn's intentions in this movement somewhat better than you did before. You might find yourself fighting a lifetime of received "wisdom"—but surely that is a challenge worth facing if we are to understand Haydn's masterpiece more fully.

About the author: Brian Moore is a trumpet player and teacher in Exeter, England. A music graduate of Exeter University, he teaches at Exeter School and Exeter College, as well as directs several school and youth ensembles. His busy playing schedule is divided between shows, orchestral, and big band work. He is currently undertaking an MA in Music with the Open University. This article on Haydn's *Trumpet Concerto* is derived from a project on the 20th-Century history of Haydn's *Concerto*. Moore's research interests currently include the performance practice of the Count Basie Orchestra. Brian Moore can be contacted through EMail (brian.moore@orange.net).

Acknowledgement

This article is derived from a project, *Haydn's Trumpet Concerto in the Twentieth Century* submitted as part of the author's MA in Music with the Open University. The author would like to thank, in particular, Ole Utnes, Crispian Steele-Perkins, and Edward Tarr for their help and advice on this project.

Bibliography

- Altenburg, J. 1974. *Essay on an introduction to the heroic and musical trumpeters' and kettledrummers' art.* 1795. Transl. by E. H. Tarr. Nashville, Tennessee: The Brass Press.
- Attwood, J. 2002. Classic Trumpet Concertos [Record review]. *The Gramophone*, April 2002.
- Bobel, D. 1975. A comparison of four editions of the Haydn trumpet concerto with the original manuscript. [Master's Thesis]. Bowling Green State University.
- Brown, P. 1990. Options: Authentic, Allowable and Possible in Performing Haydn's *The Creation*. *The Musical Times*, 131:1764, 73 – 76.
- Bullock, D. 1979. Articulations for the Haydn Trumpet Concerto. *International Trumpet Guild Journal*, 1979, 26 – 28.
- Geiringer, K. 1955. Haydn: Trumpet Concerto in E-flat. [Record Review]. *The Musical Quarterly*, 41:3, 402 – 404.
- _____. 1986. Konzerte für ein Blasinstrument und Orchester. [Music Review]. *Notes*, 42:4, 847 – 849.
- Greene, W.T. 1985. The Haydn trumpet concerto in performance. [Masters Thesis] San Jose State University.
- Hall, E. 1944. Trumpet & piano. Piano reduction by Harold Perry. London: Hawkes & Son.
- Hamilton, H. 1932. Score and parts. Manuscript copies, unpublished. London: BBC Music Library.
- Lockspeiser, E. 1944. Haydn, Trumpet Concerto, edited and arranged by Ernest Hall. [Music Review]. *Music & Letters*, 25:2, 121.
- Malloch, W. 1988. Carl Czerny's Metronome Marks for Haydn and Mozart Symphonies. *Early Music*, 16:1, 72 – 82.

- _____. 1993. The Minuets of Haydn and Mozart: Goblins or Elephants? *Early Music*, 21:3, 437 – 444.
- McNaught, W. 1939. Haydn's Trumpet Concerto. [Record Review]. *The Musical Times*, 80:1161, 749 – 750.
- _____. 1940. Clarino and Trumpet. [Letter to the Editor]. *The Musical Times*, 81:1164, 83.
- _____. 1949. Haydn's Trumpet Concerto. [Record Review]. *The Musical Times*, 90:1272, 54.
- Montgomery, D. 1992. Views, Reviews, and Nonviews: Two Studies in Historical Performance Practice. *The Musical Quarterly*, 76:2, 264 – 282.
- Moore, B. 2006. The Rebirth of Haydn's Trumpet Concerto in England in the Twentieth Century. *International Trumpet Guild Journal*, 30:4, 26 – 29
- O'Loughlin, N. 1983. Trumpeting Haydn. [Review of Tarr edition (1982)]. *The Musical Times*, 124:1686, 495.
- Robbins Landon, H. 1977. *Haydn: The Years of 'The Creation', 1796 – 1800*. London: Thames & Hudson.
- Smithers, D. L. 1978. The Baroque trumpet after 1721: some preliminary observations 2. *Early Music*, 6, 356 – 361.
- Steele-Perkins, C. 2001. *The Trumpet*. London: Kahn & Averill.
- _____. 2005. Interview with the author.
- Tarr, E. 1996. Haydn's Trumpet Concerto and its Origins. *International Trumpet Guild Journal*, 1996, 30 – 43.
- Tarr, E. & H. C. Robbins Landon. 1982. Trumpet and piano reduction. Vienna: Universal Edition.
- Trevenna, P. 1945. Score and parts. Manuscript copies, unpublished. BBC Music Library, London.
- Temperley, N. 1991. Haydn's Tempos in "The Creation". *Early Music*, 19:2, 235 – 245.
- Utnes, O. 2005. Recordings of the Joseph Haydn Trumpet Concerto. http://abel.hive.no/haydn/Recordings_of_Haydn.html
- Willener, A. 1981a. The Haydn Trumpet Concerto (Part 1) *Brass Bulletin*, 35, 33 – 40.
- _____. 1981b. The Haydn Trumpet Concerto (Part 2) *Brass Bulletin*, 36, 34 – 41.
- _____. 1982. The Haydn Trumpet Concerto (Part 3) *Brass Bulletin*, 37:1, 30 – 38.
- _____. 1990. *Pour une sociologie de l'interpretation musicale: le cas du Concerto pour trompette de Haydn*. Lausanne: Editions Payot

